SUEET JUST DISTRIBUTIONS



Version 3.1. Created by Alexander Andersson

CONTENTS

)
)
1
2
3

Most of us believe that we have a good understanding of what makes a particular matter just or fair. We may find that an equal distribution of a certain good is just, or that a distribution should first and foremost prioritize those who are worst-off, or that distributions should respect property rights even if it undermines those who are in need. We may believe that some people deserve more than others because they are productive, creative, and ambitious. We may also believe that some people who are living in misery do not deserve the bad luck they have been handed.

The problem with justice is that we may believe all of the above without realizing that most of the claims stand in stark contrast to each other. SWEET JUSTICE is a role-playing game designed for four players, offering an interactive platform for you to explore your intuitions about justice. It challenges you to make choices under pressure and witness the effects of your decisions. It is intended to be an engaging and fun learning experience about one of the most difficult questions in political philosophy -WHAT MAKES A DISTRIBUTION JUST?

INSTRUCTIONS

Congratulations! You have been assigned the role of the game leader, meaning that you have the most important task of all --making sure that everyone sticks to the rules. In this document you will find all the information needed on how to play the game in the correct fashion, so read it very carefully.

Most instructions for this game are privy to all participants. There is however some information that is, at least initially, A GAME LEADER SECRET. Make sure not to share this info with the others until instructed.

SETUP

Before the game can start, the game leader will need four character cards, 12 candies for the initial distribution, nine candies that can be added as the game progresses, and a six-sided die.



HOW TO PLAY

The main objective of the game is for the group to come up with what, in their mind is the most just distribution of candies available. As game leader you are merely a passive observer and instructor, meaning that you have no say in the discussion.

The game consists of five phases, each phase revealing additional information about the characters that the players have been assigned. Before the start of each phase, players will be briefed on their character info that is accessible to them for each respective phase.

After the briefing, the players are then granted 10 minutes to discuss what they find to be the most just distribution based on (i) the amount of candy available and (ii) the character information they have received before the phase began. It is recommended that the game leader starts each phase by setting a timer on their phone.

During a phase, the players are allowed to shuffle the candies in order to experiment with what distribution they find fair. However, each phase ends --- meaning that the distribution is final --- when (a) the 10-minute mark has passed, or, (b) the players have reached an agreement on the distribution at hand.

HOW PHOSES WORK A GAME LEADER SECRET... FOR NOW

Since you are the only one who knows why the adding and removal of candy happens initially, it is important to keep a straight face and inform the players that the reasoning behind this will become known to them as the game progresses.

(1) The game leaderbriefs the players abouttheir characters.(2) The game leaderstarts the timer.

Instructions for when and which character traits should be disclosed are available in the CHARACTERS section (p.7).

 (1) The game leader adds or removes candy based on the final distribution.
(2) The game leader performs a CHARACTER ROLL.

The players have 10 minutes to discuss and experiment with the distribution before it becomes final.

RULES

CHARACTER ROLL (WHAT?): Inform the players that at the very end of each phase, the game leader will perform a Character Roll. This determines whether the players will stick to their current characters or pass them over to one of the players sitting next to them as they enter into the next phase.

CHARACTER ROLL (How?): The game leader rolls a six-sided die and the resulting roll determines whether the players get to keep their character (roll 1 or 2), hand over their character to the player to their left (3 or 4), or hand over their character to the player to their right (5 or 6), before the start of the next phase. The handing over includes any candy that belongs to the character.

DECISION PROCEDURE: The players are allowed, but not required, to decide beforehand by what procedure decisions should be made. For example, the players may decide that majority rule determines the final distribution. Alternatively, decisions can only be made if they can reach a consensus on the matter.

EFFICIENCY: All final distributions have to be efficient, meaning that all candies available to the players need to be distributed among the characters. It is not allowed to create a community pool.

REAL WORLD IMPACT: Once the game has ended, the players get to keep the candy that their characters are in possession of, yum! Make sure to cater the choice of candy to the preferences of the players. Any surplus candy that is not in play after the final phase has ended is granted to the honorable game leader.

SURVIVAL: At the end of a phase, each character needs to be in possession of at least one candy in order to survive through the next phase. If a player does not have any candy by the end of a phase, then their character will be eliminated from the game, and the player risks being eliminated as well. Note that it is allowed that a character starts a phase without any candy, but they cannot be without any candy at the end of a phase.

PHASES CONSULT THIS SECTION AT THE BEGINNING AND END OF EACH PHASE

SETUP: Before the game starts, the game leader assigns the characters to the players. Handout the character cards/name tags.

PHASE 1: The game leader briefs the players on the information that is disclosed about each character in phase 1 (see Characters section). As the information is given to the players, the game leader sets up the initial distribution of candies: Ned gets one candy, Tina gets three candies, Eric gets four candies, and Dany gets four candies. These are the starting positions of the different characters. After this, the game leader sets a timer for 10 minutes before they allow discussions to take place.

GAME LEADER SECRET: After 10 minutes have passed, the game leader inspects how much candy each player is in possession of and removes or adds candies based on the final distribution of phase 1. Once this has been done, the game leader performs a CHARACTER ROLL before initiating phase 2.

PHASES 2, 3 and 4 play out in the same fashion. The game leader begins by briefing the players about what is revealed about their characters per the guideline for each respective phase, then sets a timer for 10 minutes before players start discussing the best possible distribution. After 10 minutes, the game leader removes or adds candies based on the final distribution before they perform a CHARACTER ROLL and move on the next phase.

At the end of PHASE 4, any events that can take place should play out in the following order: Eric's veto, Ned's consumption, Dany's sabotage, Tina's production. Any surplus added by Tina's production goes directly to her pool.

PHASE 5: The final phase reveals no new information about the characters. It is important to remind the players that this is their last chance to come up with what, in their mind is the most just distribution.

At the end of PHASE 5, any of the events that can take place should play out in the following order: Eric's veto, Ned's consumption, Dany's sabotage, Tina's production. Any surplus added by Tina's production goes directly to her pool. After this, the game leader performs a final CHARACTER ROLL before wrapping up the game (see EPILOGUE section).

CHARACTERS TINA

PHASE 1 reveals that Tina is already in posession of three candies.

PHASE 2 reveals that Tina is in fact Talented Tina, meaning that her innate talents and abilities are above average.

PHASE 3 reveals that Tina is an industry consultant that can be hired by the candy factory at a cost. Tina believes she has a rightful claim to four candies based on her promise that, if she gets four candies, she will be able to increase production at the factory, making everyone better off for the next phase. If Tina's talents introduce additional candies into the game, she alone gets to decide how this surplus should be distributed.

In fact, Tina is so confident in her abilities that she promises the other participants that the more candies she is given, the more candy she is able to produce to the common good.

GAME LEADER SECRET: But is this last claim true? See the Talented Tina Table below.

PHASE 4 reveals that Tina had a middle-class upbringing.

TALENTED TINA TABLE			
If Tina has	then add		
1 candy 2 candies 3 candies 4 candies 5 candies 6 candies	No candy No candy No candy 3 candies 3 candies 2 candies		
8 candies	1 candy		

NED

PHASE 1 reveals that Ned is already in possession of one candy.

PHASE 2 reveals that Ned is in fact Needy Ned, meaning that his innate talents and abilities are below average. Ned is the minimally compensated janitor at the candy factory. He occasionally takes candy from the production line to still his hunger. This means that Ned consumes more than he produces. Subsequently, one candy is removed from his pool at the end of each phase.

PHASE 3 reveals that Needy Ned believes he has a rightful claim to four candies based on his need to satisfy the requirements of having a decent quality of life. If Ned is granted at least four candies at the end of a phase, he will have enough to become self-sufficient, meaning that he will produce as much as he consumes. In practice, this means that the game leader no longer removes one candy from Ned's pool at the end of a phase where Ned is in possession of at least four candies.

PHASE 4 reveals that Ned had a rough working class upbringing.



ERIC

PHASE 1 reveals that Eric is already in possession of four candies.

PHASE 2 reveals that Eric's innate talens and abilities are average.

PHASE 3 reveals that Eric had a rich and affluent upbringing.

PHASE 4 reveals that Eric is in fact Entitled Eric and that he believes that he has a rightful claim to four candies based on him being the heir to the candy company. Eric is the owner of the factory, which grants him the power to veto the distribution at the end of a phase (regardless of how much candy he has).

ERIC'S VETO works as follows. At the end of a phase (i.e., when a distribution is final), Eric is granted one minute to exercise his veto. This means that Eric is allowed to redistribute candies to his liking and no one else has a say in it. It is not necessary for Eric to exercise his veto, but he has a right to do it.



DANY

PHASE 1 reveals that Dany is already in possession of three candies.

PHASE 2 reveals that Dany's innate talents and abilities are average.

PHASE 3 reveals that Dany had a middle-class upbringing.

PHASE 4 reveals that Dany is in fact Deserving Dany and that she believes she has a rightful claim to four candies based on her merit. Dany is a production worker at the factory and she is the one who made all the candy. If Dany has less than three candies at the end of a phase, she will become so disgruntled over the fact that her contribution that others aren't adequately recognizing her contributions that she will perform an act of sabotage.

If DANY'S SABOTAGE occurs, then the game leader removes one candy from the game at random. To decide which character will lose a candy, the game leader rolls a six-sided die. Tina loses a candy if the die rolls 1 or 2, Ned loses one candy if the die rolls 3 or 4, and Eric loses one candy if the die rolls 5 or 6.

EPILOGUE

What a ride! Did you have fun? Did you end up with the most perfect and just distribution? Who goes home hungry and who needs to brush their "sweet tooth" with extra care tonight? Distributing scarce resources in a fair manner is a tough task, especially when there are a multitude of conflicting reasons that call for different distributional patterns. So don't be too hard on yourselves if things did not end up the way you thought they would. Not even philosophers can agree on this, but maybe that is because they haven't played this game yet?

One final thing before you go. Please fill in the form below. Frame it, put it on your fridge, treat it as the ultimate answer to the most difficult question in political philosophy, or commit it to the flames and forget this ordeal ever happened. The choice is yours!

The game leader fills in the final distribution that was reached in phase 5. Our final distribution...

Gave lina:		
Gave Ned:		
Gave Eric: _		
Gave Dany:		
	11	

GAME VARIATIONS

As you may have observed, this game lacks a defined objective or winning condition. This is since it was created with a classroom setting in mind, where the primary goal is not to determine an 'optimal' distribution but rather to stimulate thoughtful examination and discussion of our notions of justice and fairness.

For those of you who want a more gamified experience, there are ways to modify the game to make it more suitable for a relaxed setting. See below for a couple of suggestions.

WIN CONDITION: Before you start the game, write down a couple of win conditions and then choose one at random that will be your objective for your next game round. Some examples are: "Come up with the most equal distribution while maximizing the output of the candy factory"; "Come up with the distribution that allows peoples' talents to flourish to their greatest degree"; "Make sure no one has less than two candies at the end of any round", etc. You can probably come up with a lot more entertaining win conditions, so go with whatever makes the game fun for you and your friends.

No surprises: After the first round, where the character traits are gradually revealed throughout the game, you can always remove this obstacle. Try a round where everyone knows their character traits from the start and see what strategy you will pursue when you have all the relevant information at hand.

RANDOM STRUCTURE: In its original form, the traits are unveiled in the following order: Ned, Tina, Eric and Dany. This means that all but Ned's trait are unactivated before the relevant information is disclosed. Try a round where you shuffle the order of disclosure (i.e. activation). You might have a different strategy if Eric's and Dany's traits are activated before Ned's and Tina's.

EXPAND THE CAST: You can also include more characters in the game that the game leader assigns at random before the game starts. For example, there could be a Sloppy Ned, who consumes more than he produces, but his situation is entirely his own doing and not due to unfortunate circumstances. Or, Untalented Tina, who can only contribute minimally with additional candies in the game. Perhaps you will play the game differently if Needy Ned and Sloppy Ned are part of the same game round. Come up with any ensemble that makes the game fun for you to play!

GAME ROUND EXAMPLE

Beginning of phase 1				
Player 1	Player 2	Player 3	Player 4	
Tina	Ned	Eric	Dany	
3 candies	1 candy	4 candies	4 candies	

Let's assume that the players, due to the minimal amount information they are granted in phase 1, decide to distribute the candies equally. That is, Eric and Dany give one candy each to Ned.

End of phase 1					
Player 1	Player 1Player 2Player 3Player 4				
Tina	Ned	Eric	Dany		
3 candies	3 candies	3 candies	3 candies		

CHARACTER EVENTS: Since Ned is consuming more than he is producing, the game leader removes one candy from his pool before phase 2 begins.

CHARACTER ROLL: Suppose the game leader rolls a 4. This means that every player switches their character (and candy) with the person to their left before phase 2 begins.

Beginning o <mark>f phase 2</mark>				
Player 2 Player 3 Player 4 Player 1				
Tina	Ned	Eric	Dany	
3 candies	2 candies	3 candies	3 candies	

Suppose that the group decides that it should stick with the distribution it started off with in phase 2, even though the players now know that Ned will lose one of his candies before the start of phase 3.

End of phase 2				
Player 2 Player 3 Player 4 Player 1				
Tina Ned Eric Dan'				
3 candies	3 candies			

CHARACTER EVENTS: Once again, Ned loses one of his candies before phase 3 begins.

CHARACTER ROLL: Suppose the game leader rolls a 1. This means that the players keep their current characters throughout phase 3.

Beginning of phase 3				
Player 2 Player 3 Player 4 Player 1				
Tina	Ned	Eric	Dany	
3 candies	1 candy	4 candies	4 candies	

Suppose that, since the players are now informed about Tina's character traits, they decide to grant Tina four candies. For example, Eric gives one of his candies to Tina.

End of phase 3					
Player 2 Player 3 Player 4 Player 1					
Tina Ned Eric Dany					
3 candies 1 candy 4 candies 4 candies					

CHARACTER EVENTS: In this distribution, two events take place. First, Ned's last candy is removed from the game. Ned still "survives" since he was not without a candy at the end of the phase, even though he will be without any candy at the beginning of next phase. Second, the game leader adds three additional candies to Tina's pool (see the Talented Tina Table).

CHARACTER ROLL: Suppose the game leader rolls a 3. This means that every player hands over their character (and their candy) to the person to their left before phase 4 begins.

Beginning of phase 4				
Player 3 Player 4 Player 1 Player 2				
Tina Ned Eric Dany				
7 candies	0 candy	2 candies	3 candies	

Let's assume that the group is impressed by Tina's production, and wish to invest further into her character trait. However, they also like to pursue the most egalitarian distribution available while making sure that (i) Tina increases the candy production and (ii) Dany will not be disgruntled with the distribution, subsequently sabotaging for others. Eric agrees to abstain from exercising his veto. An example of this distribution will be as follows.

End of Phase 4				
Player 3 Player 4 Player 1 Player 2				Player 2
Tina	Ned		Eric	Dany
6 candies	2 candies		1 candy	3 candies

CHARACTER EVENTS: In this distribution, two events take place. First, the game leader removes one candy from Ned's pool. Second, the game leader adds two additional candies to Tina's pool (see the Talented Tina Table).

CHARACTER ROLL: Suppose the game leader rolls a 2. This means that the participants keep their current characters throughout the final phase.

Beginning of phase 5				
Player 3	Player 4	Player 1	Player 2	
Tina	Ned	Eric	Dany	
8 candies	1 candy	1 candy	3 candies	

The game takes a dark turn. Player 1 wants to get back at the other players for neglecting Eric throughout the game. At the end of the phase, Player 1 decides to exercise Eric's veto and take all of Tina's and Ned's candy, thereby eliminating the characters from the game. Player 1 does however leave Dany's three candies alone since they do not want to risk her sabotage.

End of phase 5				
Player 3	Player 4	Player 1	Player 2	
Tina (out)	Ned (out)	Eric	Dany	
0 candies	0 candies	10 candy	3 candies	

CHARACTER EVENTS: As mentioned above, in this distribution Eric's veto was exercised, which resulted in the elimination of Tina and Ned. Player 3 and 4 are therefore without a character (at the moment).

CHARACTER ROLL: Suppose the game leader rolls a 5. This means that the players hand over their characters and their candy to the person to their right. Alas, Player 1's gamble was not successful.

Final distribution				
Player 2	Player 3	Player 4	Player 1	
Tina (out)	Ned (out)	Eric	Dany	
0 candies	0 candies	10 candy	3 candies	

Do you have questions, comments, or suggestions on how to improve the game? Feel free to send your feedback to alexandeer.andersson@gmail.com.